



---

# NOTICE OF MEETING

---

## SCRUTINY MANAGEMENT PANEL

FRIDAY, 4 JULY 2014 AT 3.00 PM

CONFERENCE ROOM A, CIVIC OFFICES, PORTSMOUTH

Telephone enquiries to Vicki Plytas, Customer, Community & Democratic Services on 023 9283 4058

Email: [vicki.plytas@portsmouthcc.gov.uk](mailto:vicki.plytas@portsmouthcc.gov.uk)

---

### Membership

Councillor Alistair Thompson (Chair)  
Councillor Simon Boshier (Vice-Chair)  
Councillor Michael Andrewes  
Councillor Alicia Denny  
Councillor John Ferrett

Councillor Hannah Hockaday  
Councillor Darren Sanders  
Councillor Phil Smith  
Councillor Matthew Winnington

### Standing Deputies

Councillor Ben Dowling  
Councillor David Fuller

Councillor Paul Godier  
Councillor Terry Hall

---

(NB This Agenda should be retained for future reference with the minutes of this meeting.)

Please note that the agenda, minutes and non-exempt reports are available to view online on the Portsmouth City Council website: [www.portsmouth.gov.uk](http://www.portsmouth.gov.uk)

### AGENDA

- 1 **Apologies for Absence**
- 2 **Declarations of Members' interests**
- 3 **Minutes of the Meeting held on 7 February 2014 (Pages 1 - 6)**

Minutes of the Scrutiny Management Panel (SMP) held on 7 February 2014

**RECOMMENDED that the minutes of the meeting held on 7 February 2014 be confirmed and signed by the Chair as a correct record.**

**4 Scrutiny Report (Pages 7 - 12)**

The City Council's Constitution requires information reports to be provided to the Scrutiny Management Panel and subsequently full Council on the work undertaken by the scrutiny panels.

**RECOMMENDED that the report be received and the work done by the panels be acknowledged.**

**5 Work Programme 2014/15 - Economic Development, Culture and Leisure Scrutiny Panel and Traffic, Environment and Community Safety Scrutiny Panel**

The panel is asked to consider and prioritise topics put forward for review to determine the work programme for the Municipal Year for the Traffic Environment and Community Safety and Economic Development Culture and Leisure scrutiny panels.

An item will be included on future agendas as appropriate to consider any new topics put forward for review by themed scrutiny panels.

**RECOMMENDED that the Scrutiny Management Panel determine the work programme for the remainder of the Municipal Year for the Economic Development Culture and Leisure and Traffic Environment and Community Safety Scrutiny Panels.**

**6 Verbal Updates from Chairs of Scrutiny Panels**

An opportunity will be given to any scrutiny chair who wishes to do so, to provide an update on the work of their panel.

**7 Date of Next Meeting**

The next meeting is scheduled for 25 July 2014 at 3pm.

Please note that agenda, reports and minutes are available to view on line on the Portsmouth City Council website: [www.portsmouth.gov.uk](http://www.portsmouth.gov.uk)

Full Council and Cabinet meetings are digitally recorded, audio only.

# Agenda Item 3

## SCRUTINY MANAGEMENT PANEL

MINUTES OF THE MEETING of the Scrutiny Management Panel held on Friday, 7 February 2014 at 2.00 pm at the Conference Room B - Civic Offices

### Present

Councillor Michael Andrewes (Chair)  
Councillor Peter Eddis  
Councillor Ken Ellcome  
Councillor Mike Park  
Councillor Jim Patey  
Councillor Matthew Winnington  
Councillor Phil Smith (In place of Councillor Will Purvis)

### Officers Present

Chris Ward, Head of Finance and S151 Officer  
Stewart Agland, Local Democracy Manager  
Paddy May, Corporate Strategy Manager  
Jane Tume, Highways PFI Manager

#### 1. Apologies for absence (AI 1)

Apologies for absence were received from Councillor Robert New and from Councillor Will Purvis for whom Councillor Phil Smith deputised.

It was noted that there was one vacant position on the membership of the committee following Councillor Stockdale being appointed as the Cabinet Member for Environment & Community Safety.

#### 2. Declarations of Members' interests (AI 2)

There were no declarations of interest.

#### 3. Minutes of the Meetings held on 5 and 7 November 2013 (AI 3)

**RESOLVED** that the minutes of the meetings held on 5 and 7 November 2013 be confirmed and signed by the chair as a correct record.

#### 4. Update by Head of Finance and S151 Officer on the Budget 2014/15 (AI 4)

(TAKE IN HANDOUT ON BUDGET SCRUTINY COUNCIL TAX SETTING 2014/15 AND MEDIUM TERM BUDGET FORECAST 2014/15 TO 2017/18)

Chris Ward, Head of Finance & Section 151 Officer gave the presentation to members. The summary and conclusions were set out on page 8 of the presentation.

In response to queries the following matters were clarified:

- Council's role is to agree the budget in terms of the value of the savings - not the detail of them.
- In terms of the business rates, many appeals had been received that had been successful and consequently the money received may well be less than expected in terms of the value originally set by the valuation office.
- The reason for creating a park and ride reserve was that the expectation was that it would take three years to break even.
- In response to a query about whether the 1% pay increase reserve mentioned would be enough to enable the authority to compete with the private sector given that the economy was improving, Mr Ward said that this could be addressed by targeting market supplements where this was a particular problem.
- With regard to the issue of NHS pay rates being generally higher than local authority pay rates, Mr Ward said that these would not be equalised other than through turnover of staff.
- Mr Ward confirmed that an increase in the number of houses meant that more council tax would be received which could compensate for losses in income elsewhere.
- The new rules around portfolios being able to carry forward underspends and overspends had been designed to encourage responsible spending and guard against the "use it or lose it" scenario.

Members commented that they believe that portfolio spending should be much more accurate. However Chris Ward said that given the overall size of the budget, the amount by which the actual spend was adrift was good in comparative terms.

**RESOLVED that the presentation be noted.**

**5. Consideration of notice of motion referral from Full Council concerning Transparency and Openness (Filming of meetings) (AI 5)**

(TAKE IN REPORT)

The Local Democracy Manager introduced the report which provided information to the panel following the notice of motion referral from the council meeting held on 10 December 2013. He said that since the report was written the Local Audit and Accountability Bill had received royal assent on 30 January 2014. He said that this was complicated by secondary legislation that was necessary to implement exactly how to bring in and regulate the provisions.

The chair of the panel, Councillor Michael Andrewes circulated revised recommendations to council for discussion by members. During discussion the following matters were considered:

- Members did not want any associated costs to fall upon the council to fund.

- Members were generally in agreement that a working group specifically to look at the recommendations that Councillor Andrewes had circulated.
- Members wanted chairs of committees and panels to adopt a light touch approach to the matters raised in the notice of motion until such time as members make a formal decision on exactly what provisions would be brought in.

It was proposed by Councillor Michael Andrewes and seconded by Councillor Winnington that the original recommendation in the report be replaced by recommendations (1) and (2) as circulated at the meeting today and this was agreed.

**RESOLVED that the Panel recommends to Council that**

**(1) the Scrutiny Management Panel welcomes the news that the Local Audit and Accountability Act 2014 received royal assent on 30 January 2014 and this will give rise to secondary legislation on specific details of how councils should allow the filming, recording and reporting of council meetings. It therefore asks that a working group of four councillors is established in approximate proportion to the groups, nominated by their groups to prepare a report on how the practicalities of this can be implemented as soon as possible by Portsmouth City Council, how the council's standing orders should be changed, consider any changes that need to be made to meeting rooms etc, any budget implications and anything else required;**

**(2) Scrutiny Management Panel notes that technology and the internet has moved very rapidly since the standing orders were last revised and asks that the working group considers how standing orders should be revised to take account of this. In the meantime it encourages chairs of meetings to allow the use of text communication devices to enable tweeting, blogging and texting etc by councillors and members of the public so long as it does not interfere with proceedings, while noting that such use under the current standing orders is at the chair's total discretion.**

**6. Winter Maintenance Operations Plan 2013 - 2014 (INFORMATION ONLY ITEM) (AI 6)**

**(TAKE IN THE PRESENTATION WINTER MAINTENANCE OPERATIONAL PLAN 2014)**

Ms Jane Tume, Highways PFI Manager, gave the presentation. She explained that the overall aim is to ensure so far as is reasonably practicable that safe passage along the highway is not endangered by snow or ice. She said this equally applied to flooding. She explained the different roles of PCC and Colas. Basically PCC co-ordinates and ensures that the policy is adhered to and Colas delivers what is in the maintenance plan and reports to PCC.

During discussion the following matters were clarified:

- With regard to where the salt bins are situated, Ms Tume said that she was open to feedback. Sometimes the logical place for the salt bins cannot be used for various reasons such as the pavement is too narrow or where residents did not wish to have a salt bin outside their house. Initially 50 salt bins were available but this had now risen to 80. Ms Tume agreed to look at two specific roads where members felt that salt bins should be placed - Holbrook Road and Kent Road.
- Where PCC staff could not get into work to do their ordinary day job, they had been asked to do other duties for example snow clearing, but this was subject to staff capabilities being assessed. It was suggested that these assessments should take place before the incident and Ms Tume said that she would report back this comment to see if it could be implemented.
- Ms Tume said that the biggest lesson learned from snow events was that co-ordination needed to be much more joined up and as a result of this the snow desk had been set up.
- It was confirmed that advice on snow did appear on the website.

The chair thanked Ms Tume for her presentation and noted that this was an information only report.

## **7. Corporate Peer Challenge (INFORMATION ONLY ITEM) (AI 7)**

(TAKE IN INFORMATION REPORT TO SCRUTINY MANAGEMENT PANEL)

Paddy May introduced the report and said that it provided information about who the review team was, the information that was sent to the team about the authority, and details of how long they were on site, how many people they spoke to and their general programme whilst they were here. Mr May said that the full report was attached at Appendix 1.

Overall they reported that many positive things were happening but they also highlighted some issues. He said that the authority has taken the recommendations seriously and that Appendix 2 is a summary of actions in response to the recommendations. Many of the issues have been reflected in the annual governance statement for the authority and as such are being tracked through of the Governance & Audit & Standards Committee.

During discussion the following matters were raised:

- Councillor Andrewes felt that in view of the comments on liaison with the voluntary and community sector not being as good as it could be, it might useful to get some representatives to attend a future Scrutiny Management Panel meeting. Councillor Winnington said that the community ownership review carried out by the EDCL Scrutiny Panel had produced a wide ranging report which had led to progress being made on this issue. He felt that the matter could be taken forward through the EDCL Scrutiny Panel and that he would be happy to report back to Scrutiny Management Panel about progress.

- Members felt that there should be a more systematic approach to training for members. He said that the matter had been raised at Governance & Audit & Standards Committee recently and members had been advised that there was no budget as such for training and also member engagement is difficult.
- It was confirmed that e-learning and DVDs were available.
- Members raised the issue of the impact of service changes made in one part of the organisation on other services in the organisation and whether there was any evidence that this is being taken into account. Paddy May said that Financial Services are aware of this issue and there is a desire to look at the knock-on effects at an earlier stage. He said that he would talk to Chris Ward about this.
- With regard to the recommendation in the report that the council should plan as a whole ie Cabinet and strategic directors, Paddy May said that he would arrange for a note to be circulated to members about this.
- With regard to the actual people chosen to be interviewed during the CPC team's visit, members felt that it might have been more representative to get backbenchers' views. Paddy May said that the CPC team had supplied a list of those they wished to speak with during their visit. They particularly wanted to speak with new councillors, cabinet members, group leaders, scrutiny chairs and scrutiny vice-chairs. Paddy May said he would find out exactly who the members were who were consulted during the visit of the CPC team and this could be circulated outside the meeting.

The panel noted the information report and wanted two matters particularly to be highlighted:

- PCC's relationship with the voluntary and community sector and
- More systematic and tailored political development and training for councillors.

## **8. Date of Next Meeting (AI 8)**

The next meeting is scheduled for 20 March 2014 but this was subject to change depending on members' availability.

The meeting concluded at 3.30pm.

---

Councillor Michael Andrewes  
Chair

This page is intentionally left blank



# Agenda Item 4

THIS ITEM IS FOR INFORMATION ONLY



Portsmouth  
CITY COUNCIL

Agenda item:

<b>Title and Date of Meeting</b>	Scrutiny Management Panel – 4 July 2014 Council Meeting -15 July 2014
<b>Subject:</b>	Report on Scrutiny
<b>Report by:</b>	Head of Customer, Community and Democratic Services
<b>Key decision (over £250k):</b>	<b>No</b>
<b>Full Council:</b>	<b>Yes</b>

---

## 1. Purpose of report

The City Council's Constitution requires information reports to be provided to the Scrutiny Management Panel and subsequently full Council on the work undertaken by the scrutiny panels.

## 2. Recommendations

**It is recommended that the report be noted and the work done by the panels be acknowledged.**

## 3. Work Undertaken by each Panel

### Scrutiny Management Panel

The Scrutiny Management Panel has a wide remit that includes

- overall responsibility for overseeing the themed scrutiny panels (including agreeing their work programmes)
- scrutinising the budget (which includes receiving presentations from the Head of Finance and S151 officer at relevant times during the municipal year)
- receiving topics for review as a result of Notice of Motion referrals and reporting back to Council,
- receiving updates where requested on progress made with the implementation of recommendations from reviews already carried out and
- considering decisions that have been "called in".

### Agreeing work programmes

At its meeting on 5 July 2013, the Scrutiny Management Panel considered all the topics that had been put forward by the themed panels and prioritised and allocated them to the relevant themed scrutiny panels for review.

### Scrutinising the Budget

Scrutiny of the budget was undertaken by the panel at its meetings on 7 November 2013 and 7 February 2014 when it received presentations from Chris Ward, Head of Finance and S151 Officer on the Budget 2014/15. Members were given the opportunity to discuss the contents of the presentations and ask questions.

### Notice of Motion Referral

Scrutiny Management Panel received one Notice of Motion referral from Full Council concerning Transparency and Openness (Filming of meetings). This was considered at its meeting on 7 February 2014 in light of additional information being provided that the Local Audit and Accountability Bill had received royal assent on 30 January 2014. Members were advised that secondary legislation was necessary to decide exactly how to bring in and regulate the provisions. The panel made recommendations to the Council meeting held on 18 March 2014 which were accepted.

### Updates Received

The Panel received updates at its meetings on the following matters:-

- Corporate Performance in the Transforming Organisation - the Panel was advised that the approach towards measuring performance had changed significantly over the last few years. Previously the system of regulation was based on numerous national indicators and the performance management framework was based around reporting how well PCC was doing against the national indicators. Following various changes as set out in the report, it was agreed that in developing business plans, more focus needed to be on the key performance indicators that services would use to measure their efficiency and effectiveness. The Strategic Directors Board are now using the business plans produced by services to provide a focus on performance. Services are being asked to identify blocks or barriers affecting performance. (5 Nov 2013)
- Welfare Reform Update - the original scrutiny panel review into this had been completed in May 2012. The information contained in the report had quickly become out of date as many changes had been made and the panel received a detailed update. (5 Nov 2013).
- Winter Maintenance Operations Plan 2013 - 2014 - the panel received an update explaining the lessons learned following snow events and that the overall aim is to ensure so far as is reasonably practicable that safe passage along the highway is not endangered by snow or ice. In particular co-ordination needed to be much more joined up and as a result of this the snow desk had been set up. (7 February 2014).

- Corporate Peer Challenge - the panel received information about the review team, information that had been sent to them about the authority, their general programme and to whom they spoke. The full report was provided to the panel as appendix 1 of the report and appendix 2 provided a summary of actions in response to the recommendations. Many of the issues have been reflected in the annual governance statement for the authority and as such are being tracked through the Governance & Audit & Standards Committee. The panel noted the report and wanted two matters particularly to be highlighted: comments about PCC's relationship with the voluntary and community sector and the suggestion that there should be more systematic and tailored political development and training for councillors. (7 February 2014)

#### Decisions Called-in.

As part of its remit, the Scrutiny Management Panel is responsible for dealing with any decisions subject to the Call-in procedures. The panel met on one occasion during the last Municipal Year to consider a call-in of decisions relating to the Pyramids, taken by Cabinet on 10 June 2013. The panel decided that it was satisfied that adequate information had been supplied to enable the Cabinet to reach its decision and did not refer the matter back to Cabinet for reconsideration.

#### **Economic Development, Culture & Leisure Scrutiny Panel (EDCL Panel)**

Following its review into "Making Community Ownership work for Portsmouth", the EDCL panel now receives regular updates on the work of the Community Ownership Unit Portsmouth (the cross departmental, virtual team "COUP"). Members of the panel have been invited to attend some of the COUP networking events (including a talk 'Can community ownership revolutionise your neighbourhood?' given by social entrepreneur Phil Tulba on the experience of award winning social enterprise Adrenaline Alley a BMX and skate park in Corby).

During the 2013/14 municipal year the panel completed its review 'Pathways into Work for Young People' which is expected to go to Cabinet in July 2014. The report's recommendations focus on the importance of promoting employment and training opportunities such as apprenticeships, the need to make clear links between schools and local businesses, and the Council's own use of contractual arrangements to incorporate social inclusion clauses. The work with more vulnerable groups was recognised and encouraged, such as the Troubled Families Unit/Positive Family Steps giving targeted support to families and the New Belongings Project assisting care leavers with their education and employment choices. The panel was very interested in the Post 16 curriculum in the city and the variations between retake opportunities afforded by the local colleges which can impact upon employment opportunities for their students. The panel also heard from schools on their careers advice provision, the government agencies, local authority and voluntary bodies assisting young adults to prepare for work and ensuring they have the necessary skills, as well as from local employers who are seeking candidates with the relevant qualifications and attitude to ensure sustainable employment for young people in the city.

### **Housing & Social Care Scrutiny Panel (HSC Scrutiny Panel)**

#### 'Advancing the use of Technology in Adult Social Care (Telecare and Telehealth)

The HSC Scrutiny Panel signed off its report in September 2013, following 9 evidence gathering meetings hearing from service providers at the City Council, sheltered housing providers, health practitioners and the voluntary sector representatives. The Cabinet on 7 October 2013 supported the recommendations to recognise and promote the importance of Telecare and Healthcare in assisting Adult Social Care clients and Sheltered Housing residents and the preventative benefits to the healthcare system.

#### Hospital Discharge Arrangements in Portsmouth.

The panel commenced this review in October 2013. The panel heard from the council officers involved in these arrangements from a variety of departments: Adult Social Care (including occupational therapists), the Integrated Commissioning Unit, Sheltered Housing and Community Housing (with links to Telecare and external housing providers) and Housing Options. External witnesses included representatives from Age UK Portsmouth, and Hampshire Domiciliary Care Association.

The panel has also visited Queen Alexandra Hospital to meet with the Managing Director of Medicine for the Clinical Services Centre who explained the issues surrounding discharge of patients from QA.

The review is continuing and the intention is to gather evidence from those with direct experience of discharge arrangements.

### **Education, Children & Young People Scrutiny Panel**

#### School Governance Arrangements

The panel conducted a review into school governance arrangements which has recently been completed. During the course of the review the panel learned that the city has a large number of governor vacancies, particularly in the parent governor category. The panel was pleased to note that the council's school governance strategy action plan, that was approved by Cabinet earlier this year, contained a number of initiatives to improve governance in the city, including working with the Shaping Portsmouth group to promote the role to the business community.

The panel received evidence from a number of head teachers, chairs of governors and a parent governor through their attendance at panel meetings and through responses to the panel's questionnaire. This enabled the panel to obtain evidence on why governors are not staying in post, the take up of training of governors and their ability to understand school data, which was used to form their recommendations. The panel also considered the current arrangements for governing body self-review in the city.

The work of the governor services team was reviewed by the panel who concluded that they provide excellent support to governing bodies. The panel considered how

effective clerking is in the city and sent a questionnaire out to clerks and received evidence on the Hampshire CC clerking service.

A number of recommendations were made by the panel to improve governance in the city. The panel's report and recommendations will be considered by Cabinet early in the new municipal year. If approved these will feed into the school governance strategy.

### **Traffic, Environment & Community Safety Scrutiny Panel**

#### **Review of air quality in Portsmouth.**

The review assessed the progress on the 29 measures set out in the Air Quality Action Plan.

The panel recognised the significant detrimental impact of air pollution on health and the economic costs of failing to deliver the council's responsibilities. It was pleased that air quality had improved sufficiently since 2009 for 8 of the 13 Air Quality Management Areas (where levels of nitrogen dioxide were above the National Air Quality Objectives set to protect health) to be revoked; however members recognised the need for further development of the council's strategies to improve air quality and to achieve the objectives and recommended that this be done by producing a new local Air Quality Strategy.

The panel's report went to Cabinet on 1 July 2013 where all its recommendations were supported.

#### **Assessment of the progress made following Portsmouth's review of domestic abuse.**

In July 2013 the panel started a review to assess the progress made following the 2012 domestic abuse commissioning strategy which was published by the Safer Portsmouth Partnership, the Children's Trust Board and the Portsmouth Children's Safeguarding Board.

It noted that Portsmouth reports high levels of domestic abuse but this may reflect good access to and confidence in support services.

Although good progress has been made to support victims of domestic abuse, Members recommended that more work is required to fully embed a co-ordinated community response across the city and this must remain a priority for the council and its partners.

The report was signed off on 29 April 2014 and is expected to be considered by the Cabinet in July.

### **Health, Overview & Scrutiny Panel**

Over the last 12 months, the panel scrutinised regular updates from local NHS organisations and Portsmouth City Council and looked at:

- Maternity Services.
- Re provision of Exbury Ward, St James Hospital

- Possible Repatriation of Plastics from St Richard's Hospital, Chichester.
- New Ways of Working
- Framework for Assessing Change.
- Update on Public Health Progress Following the Transfer of Responsibility and Health Information.
- The Right Place, Right Time Community Lounge
- Guildhall Walk Health care Centre
- Continuing Healthcare - Section 75 Agreements
- Report on 2011-12 Five-Year Olds Dental Epidemiology Survey in Portsmouth.
- Hampshire & Isle of Wight Local Dentists Committee
- Amputation rate for diabetics
- Hampshire & Isle of Wight Pharmaceutical Committee
- St Mary's and St James Hospital Service Review
- Dementia Action Group
- Proposal to Close the Lowry Unit
- Options for the provision of Vascular Surgery for Southern Hampshire

.....  
Signed by:  
Head of Customer, Community and Democratic Services

**Appendices:**  
None

**Background list of documents: Section 100D of the Local Government Act 1972**

The following documents disclose facts or matters, which have been relied upon to a material extent by the author in preparing this report:

Title of document	Location
Minutes of Scrutiny Meetings	City Council's website
	<a href="http://www.portsmouth.gov.uk">www.portsmouth.gov.uk</a>